



JAMMU AND KASHMIR PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
Solina Srinagar, Kashmir -190009

website:<http://jkpsc.nic.in>
email:jkpscsecretary@gmail.com

Jammu: 0191-2566528 (f) 2566530
Srinagar: 0194-2312629 (f) 2312631

Subject: Provisional Select List for the post of Assistant Professor, Geology, in Higher Education Department- disposal of objections thereof.

Notice

Dated: 27.06.2024

Whereas, the Higher Education Department, vide letter No. HE/Coll/Coord/APPt/A.P./2021 dated 05.07.2021 and No. HED-GAZ/85/2022-04 dated 13.04.2022, referred one post under Open category of Assistant Professor, Geology, to the J&K Public Service Commission, for selection of suitable candidate; and,

Whereas, the J&K Public Service Commission, vide Notification No. 06- PSC (DR-P) OF 2023 dated: 01.03.2023, advertised the said post for selection; and,

Whereas, again, vide letter No. HED-GAZ/85/2022-04 dated 24.03.2023, the Higher Education Department, referred eight (08) posts (OM: 04, SC: 01, ST: 01, RBA: 01, EWS: 01) of Assistant Professor, Geology, to the J&K Public Service Commission, for selection of suitable candidates; and,

Whereas, the J&K Public Service Commission, vide Notification No. 17- PSC (DR-P) OF 2023 dated: 15.05.2023, advertised the said posts for selection; and,

Whereas, written test was conducted on 27.08.2023. The result of the written test was declared vide Notification No. PSC/Exam/S/2023/58 dated: 05.10.2023 in pursuance of Rule 42 of J&K Public Service Commission (Conduct of Examination) Rules, 2022 and Rule 31 of J&K Public Service Commission (Business & Procedure) Rules, 2021, as amended up-to-date; and,

Whereas, the viva-voce of candidates was conducted on 12th of October, 2023, with the assistance of Experts from outside of the UT. Further, one Expert was called for assessment of the publications; and,

Whereas, the provisional select list was notified vide no. Notification No. 78-PSC (DR-S) of 2023 dated: 18.10.2023 with the stipulation that the selection is provisional and objections, if any, may be submitted to the Commission within five days for examination and disposal. No claim, whatsoever, shall be entertained after five days from the date of issuance of Notification; and,

Whereas, two representations, one each from Mr. Bhart Singh and Mr. Shakti Kumar were received against the provisional Select List; and,

Whereas, Mr. Shakti Kumar, has not raised any specific issue in his representation that requires any consideration. Further, a detailed consideration order has been issued in response to the order from the Hon'ble, Central Administrative Tribunal; and,

Whereas, Mr. Bhart Singh in his representation dated 23-10-2023 and subsequently through other representations, claimed points for his following research papers on the grounds that these research have been published in the journal "AIP Conference proceedings" enlisted in the Scopus indexed Journal representing the authenticity of papers, being part of UGC-CARE List as Group- 2, and papers being peer-reviewed:-

- 1. Introduction to tunnels and tunneling operations in the Himalaya's part of India by Singh Et al., 2023.**
- 2. Does the deposition of varied shale lithofacies in the Subathu shale of Parwanoo area (H.P) represent an occurrence of oceanic anoxic events: By Singh et al., 2023.**

Whereas Mr. Bhart Singh had produced four papers before the Expert, out of which one was accepted and the rest were rejected, thereby obtaining 0.5 points; and,

Whereas, the relevant part of Rule 45, which lays down the criteria for assessment of publications, is given below:

(i) Discipline specific Research papers as 1st, 2nd or corresponding author published in peer reviewed and UGC/CARE approved journals with ISSN and positive impact factor, @ 0.50 point for each publication. The research papers must have been published not later than the cut-off date for determination of eligibility.

(ii) Publication of a book relevant to the discipline as assessed by the subject matter expert to be relevant to the subject and of a level where it can be accepted as a reference material for the post applied for and as 1st or 2nd author of book with ISBN @ 1.00 point per book. The books must have been published with ISBN not later than the cut-off date for determining eligibility.

b) The weightage for original Research material published in the academic journals mentioned hereinabove shall be subject to the following conditions:

- i) The criteria for journal shall be that it should be specialty journal recognized in the UGC-CARE list.
- ii) The assessment of the special attributes shall be made by the Expert(s) dependent upon the quality, impact factor and extent of contribution of the candidate as first, second or corresponding author.
- iii) Posters, case reports, abstracts and popular articles shall not count for weightage.
- iv) The research articles and books must have been published not later than the cut-off date determined under Rule 19.
- v) The publications/research articles should be discipline specific and related to the subject of which the interview is being held.

c) Credit for books published by the candidate shall be only for such books as are assessed by the expert to be relevant to the

subject and of a level where the book can be accepted as a reference material at least at the level of the minimum qualification for the post.

- d) Wherever the papers/publications etc are based on thesis/dissertation etc for which any benefit has been availed either at eligibility or at higher qualification level, such papers/publications etc shall not be accepted.

Whereas, the matter was referred to the Expert, who had assessed these papers at the time of interview and his reply was as under:-

The two papers submitted by the applicant for consideration were evaluated as per the guidelines set for the evaluators by the PSC. During the evaluation, it was found that the said papers, although Scopus indexed, do not fulfill the criteria set for research and publications by the PSC in Rule 45 (Special Attributes: Research and Publications) given the following:

First, the two papers are conference proceedings papers rather than Peer-Reviewed Journal papers.

Second, the two conference proceedings papers were not published in a discipline-specific journal rather than in the conference about "General Physics and Astronomy".

Whereas, it was decided that all the papers of all the candidates along with those of Mr. Bhart Singh, may be further referred to the two Experts who had interviewed the candidates, for their review. Accordingly, vide letter No. PSC/DR/AP-Geology/2023 dated 15.12.2023, all the papers of the candidates, under the Special Attributes, which were accepted at the time of Interview, alongwith the papers of the candidates which have not been accepted, were forwarded to the said Experts with a specific request whether the two papers of Mr. Bhart Singh can be considered for award of marks, along with the similarly situated papers of other candidates. The two experts replied that:-

1. *We have examined the case in detail and as per the information available on the website, "AIP Conference Proceedings" is a Serial published by the American Institute of Physics since 1970. It publishes the proceedings from scientific meetings, including large international conferences and small specialist workshops. Accordingly, they consider it to be a trusted publishing partner for more than 40 years and it is continuously publishing.*

2. *However, there is no mention in its website that 'AIP Conference Proceedings' is a full fledge journal though it has an impact Factor of 0.189. It remains still unclear from the website information that it is peer reviewed. We have also tried to contact 'AIP Conference Proceedings' but so far we have not received any response.*

3. *The AIP Conference Proceedings is listed in Scopus (UGC CARE List II) in the "Conference Proceedings" category for the subject area "Physics and*

Astronomy: General Physics and Astronomy". Thus, it does not qualify as a UGC CARE List JOURNAL.

4. The two articles by Bhart Singh et al, are **conference proceedings** of "Advances in Manufacturing Technologies and Application of Artificial Intelligence: AMTAAI 2021" held in Dehradun, India on 6-7 August 2021. It is published by AIP Conference Proceedings. While the title of the papers (conference proceeding) is related to the field of geology, they are nowhere even distantly related with the theme of the conference.....Further , in view of the insufficient information available on the website, we are unable to decide whether to give marks for the papers published in 'AIP Conference proceedings'.

Whereas, it was decided to obtain opinion of two more experts. As such, the publications were referred separately to two experts whose reply is given below:-

Expert -I

..... "3rd and 4th contributions are not published in Peer Reviewed Journal hence only one publication in peer reviewed Journal in the credit of Dr. Bhart Singh. AIP Conference Proceedings has been a trusted publishing partner for more than 40 years, delivering fast, affordable, and versatile publishing for maximum exposure of your meeting's key research. However, it cannot be considered at par with the following Journals:

Proceeding of Indian National Science Academy
The Palaeobotanist
SN Applied Sciences
Applied Computer and Geosciences.

.....The name of Dr Bhart Singh might not have been included by the expert committee while screening based on Impact factor however as per UGC guidelines impact factor of Journals cannot be a deciding factor for elimination of candidates for scrutiny.


It is up to the decision of the University selection committee to include the name of Dr. Bhart Singh based on the requirement for a specific position. If possible, he can be given a chance along with other eligible candidates to judge his teaching potential."

Expert II

"Although it is listed in the Scopus, it is not a journal. It is a conference proceeding. Source type of the publication is mentioned as conference proceedings in the Scopus list also. Hence not considered".

Whereas, as can be derived from the opinions reproduced here-in-above, the two papers claimed by Mr. Bhart Singh to be fulfilling the requirement of Rule 45 of J&K PSC (Business & Procedure) Rules, 2021, is devoid of any merit .

Now, therefore, in view of the afore-quoted facts and circumstances of the case, the claim of the applicant Mr. Bhart Singh is hereby considered and rejected.


27/06/24
(Bashir Ahmad Dar) JKAS
Secretary

J&K Public Service Commission

Dated: .06.2024

NO. PSC/DR/AP-Geo/2023

Copy to:

1. Principal Secretary to the Government, Higher Education Department, Civil Secretariat, Srinagar/Jammu.
2. Private Secretary to Chairman, J&K PSC for information of Hon'ble Chairman.
3. In-charge Website, J&K PSC
4. Notice Board, Srinagar/Jammu.